Appendix B – Panel Score Structure

Documentation (15 pts): The extent to which the entrant demonstrates knowledge of the beverage's creation and history in the Middle Ages/Renaissance.

15	 Thorough, clear, interesting, and provides information about the beverage from multiple reputable sources that demonstrate the period existence of the beverage Presents period recipe, documents all the ingredients and processes mentioned in that recipe to period practices Demonstrates understanding of how historical processes and ingredients affect the beverage and how they differ from modern processes and ingredients Description of how a shift (if any) from period to modern practices changed the outcome
	• Provides an insightful analysis of the sources used and demonstrate a solid understanding of historically accurate beverages and their societal context
14 - 11	 Provides clear information about the beverage from at least one reputable, period source, including a bibliography Presents a period recipe, documenting all the ingredients and processes mentioned in that recipe Demonstrates understanding of how historical processes and ingredients are similar/different from modern equivalents Description of how a shift (if any) from period to modern practices might change the outcome
10 - 7	 Provides clear information about the beverage from a source that demonstrates the beverage existed in period, including a bibliography Presents a recipe and procedure, listing all ingredients with some discussion as to how this beverage is or relates to a period beverage or ingredients
6 - 4	Includes: recipe, procedure
3 - 1	• Labels the beverage

Authenticity (15 pts): The extent to which the beverage is representative of a Middle Age/Renaissance beverage.

15	• Based directly on an extant period example, produced according to period practices for the type of beverage including, but not limited to, ingredient preparation, fermentation, finishing and aging
14 - 11	• Based directly on a period example or a plausible redaction (i.e. Substitutions in ingredients produce some changes and are the result of using some modernly available ingredients); produced using mostly period practices for the type of beverage
10 - 7	• Based closely on a period example or a plausible redaction (i.e substitutions in ingredients produce some changes and are the result of using modernly available ingredients); is produced with post-period procedures
6 - 4	• Loosely based on a period example or description of a beverage, utilizing modern ingredients, made mostly by modern practices
3 - 1	Based on a post-period beverage

Complexity (15 pts): The involvement of the procedures that the brewer has undertaken in an effort to simulate the processes used in Middle Age/Renaissance brewing. The level of difficulty of the process used in the creation of the entry.

15	Used entirely period procedures, appropriate tools and ingredients available in period.
	 When possible, ingredients were grown and harvested or collected by the entrant
14 - 11	• Used difficult-to-obtain ingredients toand followed complex period procedures (including roasting one's own grains,
	heating the wort with rocks, keeping one's own bees, etc).
	 Produced with a mix of modern equipment and tools available in period
10 - 7	• Followed period creation procedures with modern tools, including (but not limited to) period mashing procedures,
	but using a thermometer (for beers), period pressing procedures (for wines or ciders) but fermenting in stainless steel,
	etc.
6 - 4	• Used modern techniques and some period materials to produce a simple beverage.
3 - 1	• Use pre-packaged kit with no substitutions

Exploration (15 pts): The degree to which the artisan digs into and investigates the example(s) that inspires their work in order to develop their process.

15	• Thoroughly investigated the example down to minute details in order to drive a truly compelling reconstruction
14 - 11	• Investigated a number of significant "moving parts" of the example in order to support authentic reconstruction
10 - 7	• Investigated at least one important or interesting component of the example in a way that helps the item to be more authentic (i.e. "how big was a gallon in 16th century London?")
6 - 4	• Engaged in some minor original investigation or interpretation of the example
	 accepts a period example mostly at face value
3 - 1	• Used someone else's work (i.e. someone else's redaction, a tertiary source, a random recipe online) with no
	significant original input

Workmanship (30 pts): The extent to which the entry matches what we know of the characters of the beverage or style

30 - 29	 Entry exhibits balanced and appropriate flavor expression and bouquet from all ingredients culminating in an outstanding beverage; exhibits appropriate carbonation to the style, proper body/mouth-feel and amount of 'dryness', 'sweetness' or 'sour character' is on target given the style and brewer's stated goal; exhibits appropriate clarity to the style and time period Entry itself is the epitome of period beverages - balanced and delicious
28 – 21	 Entry exhibits most of the following: pleasing and appropriate flavor for beverage, appropriate bouquet for beverage, appropriate carbonation for style, proper body/mouth feel, dryness/sweetness on target for beverage, appropriate clarity for style Entry is flavorful and very tasty
20 - 13	 Entry exhibits some of the following: pleasing and appropriate flavor for beverage, appropriate bouquet for beverage, appropriate carbonation for style, proper body/mouth feel, dryness/sweetness on target for beverage, appropriate clarity for style Entry is a drinkable beverage, but with some minor flaws
12 - 7	 Entry exhibits one of the following: pleasing and appropriate flavor for beverage, appropriate bouquet for beverage, appropriate carbonation for style, proper body/mouth feel, dryness/sweetness on target for beverage, appropriate clarity for style Entry is a drinkable beverage, but shows several flaws
6 - 1	 Unpleasant to drink Flaws in taste/texture/aroma of beverage severely limit the drinkability

Aesthetics (10 pts): The extent to which the entry is presented appropriately and pleasantly, and the drinkability of the beverage itself.

10	• Presented in a documented appropriate manner for the time, place and culture of the beverage with any additional accouterments required (drinking cup, bottle opener, etc.) and any other appropriate ambiance for the entry (place setting, additional comestibles, etc)
9 - 7	• Presented in a container documented as appropriate to the time, place and culture from which the example originates
6 - 5	 Presented in a plausibly historical container (a leather costrel, non-modern glassware, etc)
4 - 3	• Presented in a bottle suitable to the beverage type (i.e. wine in a wine bottle as opposed to a beer bottle)
2 - 1	• Presented in an inappropriate container (i.e. a mason jar)